

URBAN DESIGN PROOF OF EVIDENCE

Dominic Scott BA(Hons) Dip Landscape Architecture (Distinction) MLI

SITE: FORMER BUZZ BINGO SITE, BOLTON ROAD, BANBURY OX16 0TH

on behalf of

CHURCHILL RETIREMENT LIVING LTD

CHURCHILL HOUSE

PARKSIDE

RINGWOOD

BH24

20th July 2022

Town and Country Planning Act 1990

APPEAL BY CHURCHILL RETIREMENT LIVING LIMITED AGAINST THE FAILURE OF CHERWELL DISTRICT COUNCIL TO DETERMINE A PLANNING APPLICATION FOR REDEVELOPMENT OF THE BUZZ BINGO SITE AT THE JUNCTION OF BOLTON ROAD, CASTLE STREET AND NORTH BAR STREET IN BANBURY FOR 80 [NOW 78] RETIREMENT LIVING APARTMENTS INCLUDING COMMUNAL FACILITIES, CAR PARKING AND LANDSCAPING AND A SEPARATE LISTED BUILDING APPLICATION FOR REMEDIAL WORKS TO THE EXTERNAL ELEVATIONS OF TRELAWN HOUSE AT 34 NORTH BAR STREET FOLLOWING THE DEMOLITION OF THE BUZZ BINGO BUILDING.

SITE AT: FORMER BUZZ BINGO SITE, BOLTON ROAD, BANBURY OX16 0TH

REF: 21/04202/F and 22/04179/LB

**PLANNING INSPECTORATE REF:
APP/C3105/W/22/3296229 and APP/C3105/W/22/3298661**

PLANNING INQUIRY DATE: 09th AUGUST - 16th AUGUST 2022

**PROOF OF EVIDENCE AUTHOR: Dominic Scott
BA (Hons)
Dip Landscape Architecture (Distinction)
MLI**

Urban Design Director, Barton Willmore now Stantec

Barton Willmore now Stantec
The Blade
Abbey St
Abbey Square
Reading
RG1 3BE

Tel: 0118 943 0000

Ref: 33574/A5/DS

Email: dominic.scott@bartonwillmore.co.uk

Date: July 2022

COPYRIGHT

The contents of this document must not be copied or reproduced in whole or in part without the written consent of Barton Willmore LLP.

All Barton Willmore stationery is produced using recycled or FSC paper and vegetation oil based inks.

CONTENTS

Page

Volume I: Main Text

1.0	Qualifications and Experience	1
2.0	Scope and Structure of Evidence	2
3.0	Background	4
4.0	The Planning Policy Context Relating to Urban Design	7
5.0	The Urban Design Proposals	9
6.0	Reviewing the Proposed Design Against the Policy	11
7.0	Responding to the Urban Design Reasons for Refusal	25
8.0	Conclusion	31

VOLUME II: Appendix - Urban Form Analysis - December 2021

VOLUME III: Appendix - Tyre Depot Layout - July 2022

1.0 QUALIFICATIONS AND EXPERIENCE

- 1.1 My name is Dominic Scott and I am an Urban Design Director at Barton Willmore, now part of Stantec. I am a Chartered Landscape Architect and a Member of The Landscape Institute (MLI). I gained a Bachelor of Arts Honours degree in Landscape Architecture in 1987 and a Postgraduate Diploma (with Distinction) in Landscape Architecture in 1989, both from Manchester Polytechnic.
- 1.2 I have worked for over 30 years in the design industry as both a Landscape Architect and in the last 20 years as a Masterplanner and Urban Designer. The work undertaken has included a wide range of types and scales with projects ranging from small scale urban interventions to the planning of New Garden Town communities. Notable projects include the masterplans for The Oxford Science Park for Magdalen College, the Phoenix Initiative (an urban regeneration project in Coventry city centre), the regeneration of the former MG Rover car plant at Longbridge and the design of Easton Park a new 10,000 dwelling Garden City Community adjacent to Stansted Airport.
- 1.3 During these 30 years my Urban Design work has often included Local Character Studies and analysis work for existing and proposed schemes. These usually but not exclusively feature in the subsequent production of Vision documents, Outline Planning Applications and Design codes. My expert witness experience started over ten years ago with the Church Fields, Daventry (co-joined) Public Enquiry and more recently I have appeared at the successful Paddock Wood Appeal Hearing for Churchill Retirement Living in October 2020.
- 1.4 I joined Barton Willmore now Stantec in 2001 and currently manage a team of 14 Urban Designers who hold a mixture of qualifications in Town Planning, Architecture and Landscape Architecture.

2.0 SCOPE OF EVIDENCE

- 2.1 I have been instructed on behalf of Churchill Retirement Living Ltd ('the Appellant') to prepare and present evidence in respect of proposals for 80 [now 78] retirement living apartments – including communal facilities, car parking and landscaping and a separate listed building application for remedial works to the external elevations of Trelawn House at 34 North Bar Street following the demolition of the Buzz Bingo building. The instruction was made after the submission of the Planning Application and is intended to be both an independent view of the Urban Design matters relating to the site and its context and an audit of the Council's reasons for refusal.
- 2.2 I have reviewed specifically the Reasons for Refusal (paragraphs 4.25 to 4.33 inclusive within the Suggested Refusal Reason No.1 section and paragraph 4.44 within the Suggested Refusal Reason No.3 section) as set out in the Cherwell District Council Statement of Case, and my evidence relates to Urban Design only points.
- 2.3 I have reviewed the existing site and local context from an urban design point of view. I have reviewed the design development and current proposals which are subject to these applications. I have assessed the proposed scheme and considered whether in my opinion the urban design response to the existing context amounts to an appropriate design and would positively contribute to the overall environment of the local area and specifically the Banbury Conservation Area, as required in planning policy. I have also considered whether the proposal is in keeping with the local character.
- 2.4 My evidence deals solely with urban design issues, specifically the Reasons for Refusal related to design, scale, height, massing, siting and layout and the character of the area, although these inevitably cross over other issues. In particular, my proof will overlap with Mr Jackson's Proof of Evidence on Architecture and Design on all these issues but focus on the broader, contextual urban design elements of Reason for Refusal 1, and respond to Reason for Refusal 3 in detail. I defer to Mr Shellum on Policy issues, and Mr White on Heritage.
- 2.5 This Proof of Evidence is submitted on behalf of Churchill Retirement Living Limited (the Appellant) in support of its appeal against the Refusal of Planning Permission at the Former Buzz Bingo Site, Bolton Road, Banbury OX16 0TH ref: 21/04202/F and 22/04179/LB for the:

Erection of 80 [now 78] retirement living apartments including communal facilities, car parking and landscaping and a separate listed building application for remedial works

to the external elevations of Trelawn House at 34 North Bar Street following the demolition of the Buzz Bingo building

Structure of Evidence

2.6 My written evidence should be read alongside the companion Volume II Appendix - Urban Form Analysis (December 2021), and Volume III Appendix - Tyre Depot Layout (July 2022), as well as the Summary of Appeal Proposal Drawings & Images (June 2022), which provide urban design diagrams, revised plans, elevations, and cross sections, context photos, Churchill Developments precedents, and Verified Views relevant to this Proof of Evidence.

Professional Endorsement

2.7 The evidence which I have prepared and provided for this appeal in this proof of evidence is true and has been prepared and is given in accordance with the guidance of my professional institution and I confirm that the opinions expressed are my true and professional opinions.

Dominic Scott BA (Hons) Dip LA (Distinction) MLI

Date:

3.0 BACKGROUND

The Appeal Site

- 3.1 A detailed description of the Site is included in Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 2.1. Key urban design characteristics relevant to my proof include are described below.
- 3.2 The Site is located at the north western corner of Banbury Town Centre within a brownfield site currently occupied by the former Buzz Bingo building and car park. This central Town Centre location includes nearby residential, retail, commercial and office uses.
- 3.3 The Buzz Bingo building currently creates a poor frontage and image to the whole Town Centre when approached from Warwick Road and Southam Road from the north and west. The associated car park is poorly landscaped and also creates a detrimental environment. Overall, the bleak qualities of the Site contrast the adjoining Conservation Area Main Route corridor (see Mr White's Heritage Proof of Evidence section 3.4 Banbury Conservation Area) and fail to support the nearby Town Centre uses.
- 3.4 The Buzz Bingo building also envelops three sides of the Grade II Listed Trelawn House and creates a poor environment and interface to the listed building. Mr White's Heritage Proof of Evidence includes a detailed description of the listed building in section 3.2.
- 3.5 North Bar Street, Castle Street and Bolton Road provide the western, northern and eastern edges of the Site. A Tyre Depot plot adjoins the site to the south east. Bolton Road and a footpath form the southern boundary between the site and existing residential properties. This section of Bolton Road provides the main vehicular access to the Site, and the narrow footpath provides pedestrian access from North Bar Street.
- 3.6 There is a 3.25m level change between the lower part of the site along Castle Street to the north and Bolton Road to the south.
- 3.7 The scale and massing of the area is characterised by 2.5 to 3.5 storey terraced buildings and dwellings (mainly from the early Victorian or late Georgian period) with strong, continuous building lines.
- 3.8 The northern Castle Street frontage includes a low two-storey gabled corner (Three Pigeons Inn listed building) and one-storey associated building (also listed) and a row of two- and three-storey terraces with a fairly consistent roofline punctuated by chimneys (see Banbury Brochure streetscape photos on p.12).

- 3.9 Both the eastern and western North Bar Street frontages are more diverse in height, built form and roofline with a combination of two-, two and half-, three- and a half-storey buildings generally stepping up towards St. Mary's Church to the south (see Banbury Brochure streetscape photos on p.13-14).

The Applicant

- 3.10 The applicant is an independently owned company that focuses exclusively in delivering purpose-built retirement developments across the UK. It has been operational since 1994 when it was founded, and it now manages over 200 retirement developments nationally.
- 3.11 Customer satisfaction, integrity and trust are at the heart of the success of the company as demonstrated by their Customer Charter which illustrates their commitment to providing excellent levels of service. This is reflected in the numerous awards achieved that are recognised and highly regarded throughout the retirement industry, including:
- *Home Builders Federation 5 Star Rating 2022* (the maximum rating for customer service for the seventh consecutive year).
 - *WhatHouse? Award 2021* - Bronze Award for 'Best Medium Housebuilder'
 - *WhatHouse? Award 2019* - Gold Award for 'Best Medium Housebuilder'
 - *WhatHouse? Award 2018* - Bronze Award for 'Best Medium Housebuilder'
 - *WhatHouse? Award 2017* - Bronze Award for 'Best Medium Housebuilder' and 'Best Regeneration Scheme'
 - *RESI Awards 2017* - 'Retirement Living Operator of the Year'
 - *WhatHouse? Award 2016* - Churchill Retirement Living became the first retirement developer to receive the highest accolade in the housebuilding industry by being awarded 'Housebuilder of the Year'. CRL also received the Silver Award for 'Best Retirement Development' and Bronze Award for 'Best Medium Housebuilder'
- 3.12 Easy pedestrian access to local facilities for residents is a key requirement for Churchill Retirement Living developments, which need to be located within 0.5 miles of a town centre or local centre. Therefore, the applicant has developed an outstanding track record in designing unique bespoke developments within urban built environments that are carefully informed by the local context, with a particular focus on the appropriate scale and massing, architectural design, and choice of materials.

- 3.13 The applicant maintains their developments throughout their lifetime via a sister company called Millstream Management. Therefore, high quality materials and build as well as robust maintenance regimes are crucial to the success of the business.

4.0 THE PLANNING POLICY CONTEXT RELATING TO URBAN DESIGN

The Development Plan

- 4.1 The appeal must be determined in accordance with the provisions of the Development Plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise, as per paragraphs 2 and 47 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) and section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.
- 4.2 The most relevant Development Plan policies related to design for the appeal Site are:
- Cherwell Local Plan 2011-2031 Part 1
 - ESD15 (Built and historic environment)
 - Policy Banbury 8 – Bolton Road
 - Cherwell Local Plan 1996 Saved Policies
 - C28 (Design)
 - C30 (Design)
- 4.3 In addition to the above, the Supplementary Planning Documents listed below are most relevant to design:
- Banbury Conservation Area Appraisal 2018
 - Cherwell District Council's Banbury Vision and Masterplan SPD
 - Cherwell District Council's Residential Design Guide SPD 2018

Material Considerations

- 4.4 The NPPF is a material consideration in planning decisions as described in paragraph 2, and the creation of high quality buildings and places is fundamental to what the planning and development process should achieve (paragraph 124).
- 4.5 NPPF Chapter 12 'Achieving Well-Designed Places' is the most relevant to design and includes paragraphs 124 to 136.
- 4.6 The National Design Guide (NDG, October 2014) and Building for a Healthy Life (BfHL, June 2020) are also material considerations relating to design. These are effective tools available to guide the design of developments and ensure that the final product is of good quality, as set out in Planning Practice Guidance (PPG).

Urban Design vs. Architectural Design Considerations

- 4.7 Both Mr Jackson's Design proof and my proof review the proposed development against the policies listed above. Whilst Mr Jackson's proof focuses on detailed architectural elements and how these respond to the relevant policy requirements, my proof focuses on the broader urban design and masterplanning elements of the scheme and how they respond to the wider context of the Site, including the setting of the Conservation Area and role of the Site in supporting and enhancing the Town Centre.

5.0 THE URBAN DESIGN PROPOSALS

Appeal Scheme Design

- 5.1 The appeal seeks full planning permission for the redevelopment of the Buzz Bingo site for 78 retirement living apartments including communal facilities, car parking and landscaping and a separate listed building application for remedial works to the external elevations of Trelawn House at 34 North Bar Street following the demolition of the Buzz Bingo building.
- 5.2 A detailed description of the Appeal Scheme Design is included in Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 4.1. Key urban design characteristics relevant to my proof include are described below.
- 5.3 The proposed development consists of a three and four storey building, creating a strong continuous frontage to Castle Street and North Bar Street reflecting the historical development pattern along these streets.
- 5.4 Whilst the proposal includes a single building, as opposed to the historical long terraced and burgage plots of the Conservation Area, the elevational treatment of the facades provides a vertical emphasis and rhythm that mirrors the streetscenes of Castle Street and North Bar Street (see Banbury Brochure p.46-48) and provides a high quality building frontage complementing the existing built form.
- 5.5 The change in level is resolved by placing the ground finished floor level at a mid-level on the Site which contributes to creating: a stepped up elevation towards St. Mary's Church to the south for the North Bar Street frontage in line with historical development pattern of this throughfare; and a stepped up elevation towards Bolton Road for the Castle Street frontage.
- 5.6 The Castle Street frontage reveals the blank northern elevation of Trelawn House, thus mirroring the Three Pigeons Inn corner opposite. The two exposed listed buildings are best placed to create a landmark gateway to this important junction, given their historical importance and outstanding architectural quality. The proposed Castle Street frontage steps up to create another landmark corner at the junction with Bolton Road as required by Policy Banbury 8, thus welcoming people into the Banbury 8 Area and the Town Centre facilities nearby.
- 5.7 The proposed Castle Street frontage also includes a high quality landscape corridor (also in line with Policy Banbury 8) which builds on the positive existing tree lined features of

this street to the east and provides much needed landscaping, trees and opportunities for biodiversity in a location which is predominantly characterised by hard landscaping.

- 5.8 The proposal also provides an enhanced footpath connection between North Bar Street and Bolton Road which is overlooked by the North Bar Street southern elevation, as well as by residential units overlooking the internal patio and car park.

6.0 REVIEWING THE PROPOSED DESIGN AGAINST THE POLICY

6.1 This section of the proof provides a review of the proposals against the relevant Design Policies listed in section 4 of this Proof of Evidence from an Urban Design perspective.

CHERWELL LOCAL PLAN 2011-2031 PART 1: ESD15 (BUILT AND HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT)

6.2 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"be designed to deliver high quality safe, attractive, durable and healthy places to live and work in. Development of all scales should be designed to improve the quality and appearance of an area and the way it functions."*

6.3 As Mr Jackson has stated in his proof on section 5.10.1, the proposed development provides a high quality environment which significantly enhances the setting of the Conservation Area and makes best use of this vacant brownfield site and opportunity area.

6.4 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"Deliver buildings, places and spaces that can adapt to changing social, technological, economic and environmental conditions."*

6.5 The proposal delivers a later living residential typology which is much needed in terms of catering for the needs of older people and, therefore, provides a social, economic and environmental solution for the Site which will be increasingly important as population ages (see DAS p.6 Benefits of Homes for Later Living). See also Mr Jackson's proof section 5.10.1.

6.6 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"conserve, sustain and enhance designated and non designated 'heritage assets' (as defined in the NPPF) including buildings, features, archaeology, conservation areas and their settings, and ensure new development is sensitively sited and integrated in accordance with advice in the NPPF and NPPG."*

6.7 The proposed development delivers a significant enhancement to the setting of both the Conservation Area and listed Trelawn House. See paragraphs 5.5-5.8 and further details of how the proposal conserves, sustains and enhances designated and non designated 'heritage assets' included in Mr White's Heritage proof under sections 4.

- 6.8 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"include information on heritage assets sufficient to assess the potential impact of the proposal on their significance."*
- 6.9 The Heritage Statement includes a detailed assessment of the potential impact of the proposal.
- 6.10 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"respect the traditional pattern of routes, spaces, blocks, plots, enclosures and the form, scale and massing of buildings. Development should be designed to integrate with existing streets and public spaces, and buildings configured to create clearly defined active public frontages."*
- 6.11 As highlighted in the Urban Form Analysis report submitted as part of the application, and the Tyre Depot Layout appendix to this proof, the proposed development delivers two primary frontages along North Bar Street and Castle Street which complement the Tyre Depot secondary frontage to create a perimeter block with clearly defined public and private space as per Policy Banbury 8. The strong continuous building lines along Castle Street and North Bar Street provide an appropriate sense of enclosure to these key thoroughfares which are sensitive to the setting of the Conservation Area and provide an appropriate edge to the Town Centre. See also Mr Jackson's proof section 5.10.6.
- 6.12 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"promote permeable, accessible and easily understandable places by creating spaces that connect with each other, are easy to move through and have recognisable landmark features."*
- 6.13 The key junction between North Bar Street and Castle Street defines the north western extent of the Banbury Town Centre and is currently marked by the two-storey Three Pigeons Inn listed building, and four-storey bulky recent buildings that relate poorly to this important historical landmark and key location both in terms of scale and architectural design. The requirement to deliver a landmark building on this important urban design location for the town (Policy Banbury 8) is fully satisfied by exposing Trelawn House (see also paragraphs 5.6, 7.2, 7.9) with its outstanding architectural features complementing those of the Three Pigeons Inn. The proposal also delivers an important corner between Castle Street and Bolton Road marked by a four-storey element (Policy Banbury 8) and a significantly improved footpath between North Bar Street and Bolton Road. See also Mr Jackson's proof section 5.10.8.
- 6.14 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"demonstrate a holistic approach to the design of the public realm to create high quality and multi-functional streets and places that promotes pedestrian movement and integrates different*

modes of transport, parking and servicing. The principles set out in The Manual for Streets should be followed."

- 6.15 Both Manual for Streets and Building for a Healthy Life evidence how high quality public realm and built form play a crucial role in promoting active travel. The proposal delivers significant improvements to Castle Street, North Bar Street and the footpath between North Bar Street and Bolton Road. It also delivers a high quality patio and car park for residents which will be overlooked to create a sense of safety. See also Mr Jackson's proof section 5.10.9.
- 6.16 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"limit the impact of light pollution from artificial light on local amenity, intrinsically dark landscapes and nature conservation."*
- 6.17 . See Mr Jackson's proof section 5.10.11.
- 6.18 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"be compatible with up to date urban design principles, including Building for Life, and achieve Secured by Design accreditation."*
- 6.19 A detailed BfHL assessment is included in the DAS appendix.
- 6.20 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"consider sustainable design and layout at the masterplanning stage of design, where building orientation and the impact of microclimate can be considered within the layout."*
- 6.21 The L-shaped proposed building creates a south east facing patio which will provide amenity for residents. The proposal will also deliver a landscaped edge to Castle Street and trees which will deliver improvements to the micro climate of the street. See also Mr Jackson's proof section 5.10.13.
- 6.22 Policy ESD15 on p.117 states that new development proposals should *"integrate and enhance green infrastructure and incorporate biodiversity enhancement features where possible (see Policy ESD 10: Protection and Enhancement of Biodiversity and the Natural Environment and Policy ESD 17 Green Infrastructure). Well designed landscape schemes should be an integral part of development proposals to support improvements to biodiversity, the micro climate, and air pollution and provide attractive places that improve people's health and sense of vitality."*
- 6.23 Green Infrastructure is appropriately integrated within the scheme as shown in the DAS Proposed Landscape section on p. 51.

6.24 See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 5.10 for further details.

Cherwell Local Plan 2011-2031 Part 1: Policy Banbury 8

- 6.25 Strategic Development: Banbury 8 – Bolton Road Development Area, on p.206-207 states *"The site provides the opportunity to provide high quality residential development in a Town Centre location... The Council will seek the redevelopment of the area to include a range of Town Centre and high quality residential uses that will regenerate and enliven this part of the Town Centre. Proposals should respect and enhance the historical setting, and include the creation of a high quality public realm, which ensures successful integration and connectivity with the rest of the Town Centre."*
- 6.26 In my opinion, the proposals provide a high quality urban design response to the historical setting. It also provides an attractive landscaped edge to Castle Street, amenity space for future residents, and the right kind of housing that can help older people to stay healthy and support them to live independently for longer.
- 6.27 Strategic Development: Banbury 8 – Bolton Road Development Area, on p.207 states *"A high quality landmark mixed use development in Banbury Town Centre that will support the regeneration of this area and its integration in to the wider Town Centre."*
- 6.28 The proposals provide a landmark development that will support the regeneration of the Banbury Town Centre. *"A recent report entitled Silver Saviours for the High Street (February 2021) found that retirement properties create more local economic value and more local jobs than any other type of residential development. For an average 45 unit retirement scheme, the residents generate £550,000 of spending a year, £347,000 of which is spent on the high street, directly contributing to keeping local shops open."* (DAS, p.6)
- 6.29 Strategic Development: Banbury 8 – Bolton Road Development Area, on p.207 states *"Pedestrian and cycle linkages that enable a high degree of integration and connectivity with existing networks."*
- 6.30 The proposals provide a significantly enhanced footpath between Bolton Road and North Bar Street which will promote active travel and support the regeneration of the Banbury Town Centre.
- 6.31 Strategic Development: Banbury 8 – Bolton Road Development Area, p.208 states *"A comprehensive approach to site planning and delivery is preferred with proposals being for the whole site accompanied by a detailed masterplan. A phased approach may be permitted provided that they clearly demonstrate that proposals will contribute towards*

the creation a single integrated community and coherent development. In order to achieve continuity in design and delivery of the vision, a small-scale piecemeal approach would not be appropriate. The Council will expect an application to demonstrate it has complied with the SPD and has taken into account and planned for the known or anticipated implications of the proposals on remaining areas."

- 6.32 The planning application has been accompanied by an Urban Form Analysis report (December 2021) which demonstrates that the proposal is compliant with the Adopted Banbury Vision and Masterplan SPD and can come forward without compromising the ability for other developments, including the Tyre Depot Site, to be developed also in compliance to the SPD.
- 6.33 A phased approach is permitted on the proviso that proposals will contribute towards the creation a single integrated community and coherent development which the Urban Form Analysis report (December 2021) demonstrates. The report illustrates how the 'superblock' (defined by Castle Street, North Bar Street, Parson's Street and the western edge of the Castle Quay Shopping Centre) is subdivided into four quadrants by Bolton Road and the north-south Castle Street / Parson's Street pedestrian / cycle connection.
- 6.34 The planning applications in question occupy part of the north western quadrant defined as Area 1 in the Adopted Banbury Vision and Masterplan SPD. Areas 2 and 3 can clearly come forward in subsequent phases independent of Area 1 and create an integrated and coherent development.
- 6.35 Area 1 includes the Buzz Bingo site and a smaller parcel in the south eastern corner currently occupied by a Tyre Depot. The Urban Form Analysis report illustrates how this smaller site would need to contribute a secondary frontage, which would be mostly visible only from Bolton Road, and, therefore, less constrained by the sensitivities of the Conservation Area and listed buildings along North Bar Street and Castle Street. In my opinion, this suggests that a phased delivery of Tyre Depot site would be entirely appropriate.
- 6.36 In addition to this, the Tyre Depot Layout Appendix (July 2022) accompanying this Proof of Evidence further demonstrates that the Tyre Depot site can be developed independently in accordance with the SPD and create an integrated perimeter block with the Bingo site delivering primary frontages along North Bar Street and Castle Street, and the Tyre Depot providing secondary frontages facing Bolton Road.

CHERWELL LOCAL PLAN 1996 SAVED POLICIES

- 6.37 Local Plan Policy C28 Design states: *"Control will be exercised over all new development, including conversions and extensions, to ensure that the standards of layout, design and external appearance, including the choice of external-finish materials, are sympathetic to the character of the urban or rural context of that development. In sensitive areas such as conservation areas development will be required to be of a high standard and the use of traditional local building materials will normally be required."*
- 6.38 The DAS includes an assessment of the character of the area and demonstrates an understanding of the Conservation Area Appraisal. The high quality layout, design and external appearance have been carefully considered in relation to the context of the Site. See also Mr Jackson's proof section 5.11.1.
- 6.39 Local Plan Policy C30 Design states: *"That new housing development is compatible with the appearance, character, layout, scale and density of existing dwellings in the vicinity... That new housing development provides standards of amenity and privacy acceptable to the local planning authority"*
- 6.40 The DAS includes an assessment of the character of the area and demonstrates an understanding of the Conservation Area Appraisal. The high quality layout, design and external appearance have been carefully considered in relation to the context of the Site. See also Mr Jackson's proof sections 5.12.1-2.

BANBURY CONSERVATION AREA APPRAISAL 2018

- 6.41 The DAS includes an analysis of the Conservation Area & Listed Buildings Character (p.14) which demonstrates the Appellant's understanding of the Banbury Conservation Area Appraisal 2018. See also Mr White's Heritage Proof section 3.

CHERWELL DISTRICT COUNCIL'S BANBURY VISION AND MASTERPLAN SPD

- 6.42 The proposals are compliant with the Urban Framework Plan on p.62. Two options for the corner of Castle Street were explored and acknowledged as valid by both the LPA and Applicant during design development: creating a proposed landmark narrow corner building or exposing Trelawn House. The latter was preferred in dealing with level changes and addressing this important node for the town centre. See also Mr Jackson's proof section 5.6.5.
- 6.43 The Bolton Road development area (Banbury 8) section on p. 63 states: *"that development proposals should be consistent with the design principles below, which build on the Local Plan Policy: 1. Bolton Street development area split into three development*

areas (1, 2 and 3) by the existing road network, with area 1 on the west to provide three/four storey mixed use development for residential and Town Centre uses. Existing modern buildings will need to be removed if Area 1 comes forward for redevelopment. Uses and occupiers could remain on the site."

- 6.44 The scale and massing of proposals is compliant with this design principle.
- 6.45 The Bolton Road development area (Banbury 8) section on p. 63 states: *"that development proposals should be consistent with the design principles below, which build on the Local Plan Policy: 7. Improved frontage onto Castle Street with strategic landscaping."*
- 6.46 The proposed strategic landscaping provides a high quality public realm to Castle Street in line with the principles outlined in the SPD. See also Mr Jackson's proof section 5.6.12 for further details.
- 6.47 The Bolton Road development area (Banbury 8) section on p. 63 states: *"that development proposals should be consistent with the design principles below, which build on the Local Plan Policy: 10. Environmental improvements to North Bar Street and Horse Fair to include new public realm, landscape and car parking improvements."*
- 6.48 The proposals provide active frontage and overlooking to the North Bar Street car park (Area 10 in the Urban Framework Plan), thus enhancing this space and providing an increased sense of safety.

NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK NPPF

- 6.49 Paragraph 124 states that: *"Planning policies and decisions should support development that makes efficient use of land, taking into account:*
- a) the identified need for different types of housing and other forms of development, and the availability of land suitable for accommodating it;*
 - b) local market conditions and viability;*
 - c) the availability and capacity of infrastructure and services – both existing and proposed – as well as their potential for further improvement and the scope to promote sustainable travel modes that limit future car use;*
 - d) the desirability of maintaining an area's prevailing character and setting (including residential gardens), or of promoting regeneration and change; and*
 - e) the importance of securing well-designed, attractive and healthy places."*

- 6.50 In my opinion the proposals positively respond and take into account all of the above points.
- 6.51 Paragraph 124 states that: *"The creation of high quality, beautiful and sustainable buildings and places is fundamental to what the planning and development process should achieve. Good design is a key aspect of sustainable development, creates better places in which to live and work and helps make development acceptable to communities. Being clear about design expectations, and how these will be tested, is essential for achieving this. So too is effective engagement between applicants, communities, local planning authorities and other interests throughout the process."*
- 6.52 In my opinion the proposals achieve this overarching objective of creating high quality buildings and places.
- 6.53 Paragraph 130 states that: *"Planning policies and decisions should ensure that developments:*
- a) will function well and add to the overall quality of the area, not just for the short term but over the lifetime of the development;*
 - b) are visually attractive as a result of good architecture, layout and appropriate and effective landscaping;"*
 - c) are sympathetic to local character and history, including the surrounding built environment and landscape setting, while not preventing or discouraging appropriate innovation or change (such as increased densities);*
 - d) establish or maintain a strong sense of place, using the arrangement of streets, spaces, building types and materials to create attractive, welcoming and distinctive places to live, work and visit;*
 - e) optimise the potential of the site to accommodate and sustain an appropriate amount and mix of development (including green and other public space) and support local facilities and transport networks; and*
 - f) create places that are safe, inclusive and accessible and which promote health and well-being, with a high standard of amenity for existing and future users; and where crime and disorder, and the fear of crime, do not undermine the quality of life or community cohesion and resilience.*
- 6.54 As described in points 6.2-6.24 the proposals satisfy the requirements set out in Paragraph 130.

- 6.55 Paragraph 131 states that: *"Trees make an important contribution to the character and quality of urban environments, and can also help mitigate and adapt to climate change. Planning policies and decisions should ensure that new streets are tree-lined."*
- 6.56 Proposals provide much needed street trees along Castle Street.
- 6.57 Paragraph 132 states that: *"Design quality should be considered throughout the evolution and assessment of individual proposals. Early discussion between applicants, the local planning authority and local community about the design and style of emerging schemes is important for clarifying expectations and reconciling local and commercial interests. Applicants should work closely with those affected by their proposals to evolve designs that take account of the views of the community. Applications that can demonstrate early, proactive and effective engagement with the community should be looked on more favourably than those that cannot."*
- 6.58 See Mr Jackson's proof section 5.9.2 for details of the engagement strategy carried out with the public and relevant stakeholders.
- 6.59 Paragraph 134 states that: *"Development that is not well designed should be refused, especially where it fails to reflect local design policies and government guidance on design⁵², taking into account any local design guidance and supplementary planning documents such as design guides and codes. Conversely, significant weight should be given to:*
- a) development which reflects local design policies and government guidance on design, taking into account any local design guidance and supplementary planning documents such as design guides and codes; and/or*
- b) outstanding or innovative designs which promote high levels of sustainability, or help raise the standard of design more generally in an area, so long as they fit in with the overall form and layout of their surroundings.*
- 6.60 The proposals have carefully considered local design policies (see points 6.2-6.48) and promote high levels of environmental, economic and social sustainability (see Mr Jackson's Proof of Evidence point 5.10.14, and points 6.26, 6.28).

NATIONAL DESIGN GUIDE (NDG, OCTOBER 2014)

- 6.61 The National Design Guide has been published by the Government in 2019 and sets out the ten characteristics of well-designed places and demonstrates what good design means in practice.

- 6.62 The NDG states that: "*Well-designed places and buildings come about when there is a clearly expressed 'story' for the design concept and how it has evolved into a design proposal. This explains how the concept influences the layout, form, appearance and details of the proposed development. It may draw its inspiration from the site, its surroundings or a wider context. It may also introduce new approaches to contrast with, or complement, its context.*"
- 6.63 The NDG also states that: "*Well-designed places have... recognisable streets and other spaces with their edges defined by buildings, making it easy for anyone to find their way around, and promoting safety and accessibility; and memorable features or groupings of buildings, spaces, uses or activities that create a sense of place, promoting inclusion and cohesion.*"
- 6.64 In relation to delivering a well-designed movement network with a clear pattern of streets, the NDG also states that good design: "*limits the impacts of car use by prioritising and encouraging walking, cycling and public transport, mitigating impacts and identifying opportunities to improve air quality; (...) incorporates green infrastructure, including street trees to soften the impact of car parking, help improve air quality and contribute to biodiversity.*"
- 6.65 The visual prominence and strategic importance of the site in relation to the junction between Castle Street and North Bar Street warrants a bespoke and sensitive design approach that respects and enhances the setting of the Trelawn House listed building, which is best placed to provide a landmark corner in this location.
- 6.66 The NDG introduces ten characteristics which work together to:
- create the physical Character of a place,
 - nurture and sustain a sense of Community, and
 - positively address environmental issues affecting Climate.

Context - enhances the surroundings

Understand and relate well to the site, its local and wider context

- 6.67 The Context chapter of the DAS document prepared as part of the planning application and the accompanying Urban Form Analysis report demonstrate how the proposals relate well to the site, including its local and wider context.

Value heritage, local history and culture

6.68 An appraisal of placemaking elements within the wider context of the site has been carried out to inform the character of the proposals. In order to positively respond to the built form character of the area and Conservation Area Appraisal (See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence sections 5.4, 5.6 and 5.7 and Mr White's Heritage Proof of Evidence section 4 for further details).

Identity - attractive and distinctive

Respond to existing local character and identity

6.69 See points 6.67-6.68, Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence sections 5.4, 5.6 and 5.7 and Mr White's Heritage Proof of Evidence section 4 for further details.

Well-designed, high quality and attractive

6.70 The built form for the site draws upon architectural precedents prevalent in the local area. The elevational treatment provides vertical emphasis and roofline articulation characteristic of the Conservation Area.

Create character and identity

6.71 The proposals build upon the strong identity of Banbury Town Centre and provide a contextual architectural response to the requirements of the site.

Built form - a coherent pattern of development

Compact form of development

6.72 The development has been carefully designed to make an efficient use of this brownfield site with a mix of development and open space that optimises density and makes the most of and supports the facilities nearby (see point 8.2).

Appropriate building types and forms

6.73 Development proposals envisage an L-shaped apartment block with a built form and scale that resolves the site's changes in levels and creates an appropriate sense of enclosure and streetscape to Castle Street and North Bar Street with active frontages and natural surveillance. It also reveals Trelawn House to create a landmark historical corner building at the key junction between these two thoroughfares. (see also paragraphs 5.6, 7.2, 7.9).

Destinations

- 6.74 The development positively contributes towards the use of the adjacent Town Centre shops and mixed uses (see also points 6.28).

Movement - accessible and easy to move around

An integrated network of routes for all modes of transport

- 6.75 The proposals prioritise active travel and promote walking and cycling to local facilities as well as encouraging the use of public transport (see also point 6.30).

A clear structure and hierarchy of connected streets

- 6.76 The scale and massing of proposals are designed to provide a suitable setting for the Conservation Area and the Trelawn House listed building (see also points 3.9, 5.5, 5.6, 7.4, Mr Jackson's proof section 5.5 for further details and Mr White's Heritage Proof of Evidence section 4).

Well-considered parking, servicing and utilities infrastructure for all users

- 6.77 The development will provide a level of car parking facilities appropriate to the sustainable location of the site (see Mr Jackson's Proof of Evidence point 4.1.13).

Nature - enhanced and optimised

Provide high quality, green open spaces with a variety of landscapes and activities, including play

- 6.78 The proposal will provide a strategic landscape edge to Castle Street and a private patio for residents. See point 5.7 and DAS Proposed Landscape section on p. 51.

Improve and enhance water management

- 6.79 See DAS section on Sustainability on p.57.

Support rich and varied biodiversity

- 6.80 Tree planting is proposed along Castle Street and further details on the Biodiversity Strategy are included in the DAS on p. 58.

Public spaces - safe, social and inclusive

Create well-located, high quality and attractive public spaces

6.81 See point 5.7 and DAS Proposed Landscape section on p. 51.

Provide well-designed spaces that are safe

6.82 The proposals provide active frontages to North Bar Street and Castle Street. They also provide overlooking of the internal patio and car parking as well as the footpath link between North Bar Street and Bolton Road (see also points 5.8, 6.30).

Make sure public spaces support social interaction

6.83 The proposed amenity spaces have been designed to foster social interaction amongst residents and provide space for activities which will bring residents and visitors together.

Uses - mixed and integrated

A mix of uses

6.84 See points 5.8, 6.28 and the Economic Benefits of Homes for Later Living section outlined in the DAS on p.6.

A mix of home tenures, types and sizes

6.85 Much needed specialist accommodation will be provided on site to add to the choice available within the town, including a mix of one and two-bedroom apartments, associated communal facilities, landscaping, vehicular access and car parking.

Socially inclusive

6.86 The Social Benefits of Homes for Later Living are outlined on p.6 of the DAS.

Home and buildings - functional, healthy and sustainable

Healthy, comfortable and safe internal and external environment

6.87 See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 5.8.6.

Well-related to external amenity and public spaces

6.88 High quality, convenient and functional external spaces will be provided, including a private patio and car parking and shared private spaces. Amenity spaces will have a reasonable degree of privacy and have been designed to respond to the local character.

Attention to detail: storage, waste, servicing and utilities

6.89 See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 5.10.9.

Resources - efficient and resilient

Follow the energy hierarchy

6.90 See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 5.10.14.

Selection of materials and construction techniques

6.91 See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence sections 5.2.4, 5.7.12, 5.7.16, 5.8.1, 5.8.4, 5.10.7, 5.10.16.

Maximise resilience

6.92 See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 5.8.6.

Lifespan - made to last

Well-managed and maintained

6.93 See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 5.2.4, 5.2.5, 5.8.1, 5.8.6, 6.13.

A sense of ownership

6.94 See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 2.2.10, 4.1.6, 4.1.15, 5.2.1, 5.2.5, 5.8.6, 6.9.

BUILDING FOR A HEALTHY LIFE

6.95 A detailed BfHL assessment is included in the DAS appendix.

7.0 RESPONDING TO THE URBAN DESIGN REASONS FOR REFUSAL

Overview

This section of my proof provides a detailed response to the Cherwell District Council Statement of Case on Reason for Refusal No.1 (Urban Design only points within paragraphs 4.25 to 4.33 inclusive) and Reason for Refusal No.3 (paragraph 4.44) which are highlighted in italics below.

Suggested Refusal Reason No.1

7.1 Paragraph 4.25 of the SoC states that:

"Policy Banbury 8 requires a high quality landmark mixed use development that will support the regeneration of this area and its integration into the wider Town Centre. The policy also requires a design which respects and enhances the conservation area and the historical grain of adjoining area and in particular, the Grade II Listed building Trelawn House to the west of the site. There is great opportunity here to enhance this part of Banbury, providing a rich grain of streetscape and urban housing development which draws on the architectural and historical context of the site and conservation area as a whole".

7.2 In my opinion proposals provide an enhancement of the conservation area and a high quality urban design response to this important location. The Trelawn House Grade II Listed building is exposed to mark an important corner between Castle Street and North Bar Street mirroring the Three Pigeons Inn listed building opposite to the north and thus creating a gateway for people approaching the site and town from Warwick Road and Southam Road. The urban grain and streetscape is in keeping with the conservation area and provides an enhanced setting which also contributes a high quality landscaped edge and much needed street trees to Castle Street.

7.3 Point 4.26 of the SoC states that:

"The site forms part of an important and visually prominent urban block within the centre of Banbury which lies within and adjacent to the Banbury Conservation Area. It is accepted that the quality of the street scene here has suffered in recent past, but the re-development of this site gives a great opportunity to improve this busy and prominent junction with high quality, well-designed landmark buildings which respect the historic core and adjacent heritage assets in terms of scale, massing, design and choice of materials. It should also be mindful of the setting of listed buildings and the heritage views as discussed above".

7.4 The scale, massing, design and choice of materials for the proposed building have been carefully considered in light of the sensitive heritage assets and character of the existing

urban fabric. The proposed 3 and 4 storey scale and massing is in line with the requirements set out in the SPD and provide a stepping down towards the Trelawn House Grade II Listed building which is typical of the Banbury conservation area. Vertical emphasis in the elevational treatment is also characteristic of the traditional urban form in the area and contributes to providing a suitable setting for the both the conservation area and the listed building.

7.5 Point 4.27 of the SoC states that:

"Policy Banbury 8 also sets out a number of site-specific design and place shaping principles relating to the development of the site. One of these is that the development should comply with Policy ESD15 of the CLP 2015. Policy ESD15 advises that the design standards for new development, whether housing or commercial are equally important, and seeks to provide a framework for considering the quality of the built environment, to ensure that we achieve locally distinctive design which reflects the context within which it sits. This policy also advises that the design of all new developments will need to be informed by an analysis of the context, together with an explanation and justification of the design principles that have informed the design rationale which should be demonstrated in a Design and Access Statement. The application was accompanied by a Design and Access Statement which generally assesses only the immediate context of the site and does not assess more widely the historic core. The document includes several photos of the existing area and site. A number of precedent development photos are included on page 10 of the document, but it is unclear how these relate specifically to Banbury and are not locally distinctive in their design."

7.6 The DAS document submitted as part of the planning application provides an extensive analysis of the local and wider context including: a description of the contextual history of the site accompanied by historic maps and photographs of the site (p.13); an appreciation of the wider conservation area and how the site relates to the various character areas within it (p.14); a series of existing site photographs (p.15-16); a selection of nearby relevant precedents (p.17); an analysis of the existing scale and massing (p.18), building typologies (p.19) and site connectivity (p.20); culminating in clear and concise visual representations of the site's constraints and opportunities (p.21-22) and complemented by an analysis of the existing streetscenes (p.23-24). The precedent development photos included on page 10 are a clear demonstration of the Appellant's ability to deliver high quality design solutions within sites of a similar complexity.

7.7 Moreover, an Urban Form Analysis report was produced and submitted alongside the proposals to demonstrate the Appellant's thorough understanding of the requirements of the site in relation to the conservation area and with the Banbury 8 policy requirements,

including: an analysis of the Bolton Road Development Area (Banbury 8) in relation to the wider Town Centre (p.2), an analysis of the existing condition and primary and secondary block frontages and uses to be delivered (p.4-5), an understanding of the movement and public realm requirements and how they fit in the superblock defined by Castle Street, North Bar Street, Parson's Street and the Castle Quay Shopping Centre (p.6-7). A three-dimensional axonometric diagram demonstrating how the proposal for retirement living apartments delivers an important component of the holistic redevelopment of the Bolton Road Development Area in line with the Banbury 8 policy requirements (p.8-9).

7.8 Point 4.28 of the SoC states that:

"It is essential from an urban design perspective to understand the visual impacts of the heights proposed along key vistas around the site as well as the setting of adjacent listed buildings, views of St Mary's Church and the impact upon the character and appearance of the Banbury Conservation Area. The proposed heights are of particular importance when seen in the context of Grade II Listed Trelawn House."

7.9 The Visually Verified Montages unequivocally demonstrate how the proposals provide a high quality design response which enhances the views and vistas around the Banbury Conservation Area and of St Mary's Church. Moreover, the proposals expose the Grade II Listed Trelawn House and 'elevate' its location to create a prominent landmark corner which, in tandem with the Three Pigeons Inn listed building opposite, create an important gateway into the Banbury Town Centre.

7.10 Point 4.29 of the SoC states that:

"Design is not only about the physical appearance of a development but how it works, functions and fits together, both in terms of itself and with that around it. The masterplan and layout plan must be robust having derived from a full understanding of both the site's constraints and opportunities and its setting, resulting in a new development that sits comfortably with its location and surroundings."

7.11 Points 7.7 and 7.8 describe the thorough appraisal of the existing site constraints, opportunities and setting (including its wider context) that was undertaken in producing the DAS. See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 5.2.3 which outlines the robust maintenance regimes that Churchill Retirement Living operate on their developments.

7.12 Point 4.30 of the SoC states that:

"Paragraph 130 of the NPPF states that planning decisions should ensure that developments: function well and add to the overall quality of the area, not just for the

short term but over the lifetime of the development; are visually attractive as a result of good architecture, layout and appearance and effective landscaping; and are sympathetic to the local character and history, including the surrounding built environment and landscape setting, while not preventing or discouraging appropriate innovation or change."

7.13 See points 3.13, 6.41, 7.6 and 7.7. See also Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence section 5.2.4, 5.2.5, 5.8.1, 5.8.6, 6.13 on the robustness of proposals.

7.14 Point 4.31 of the SoC states that:

"The Council's adopted Residential Design Guide SPD 2018 also seeks to ensure that new development responds to the traditional settlement pattern and character of a town. It advises in Section 3 that in assessing the townscape it is important to question 'how might the scheme reflect locally distinctive relationships between buildings and the public realm', such as building forms, groupings, heights, rooflines and architectural details, wall and surface materials."

7.15 The proposal responds positively to the traditional settlement pattern and character of Banbury. It provides active frontage along North Bar Street with a vertical emphasis and roofline articulated by chimney in keeping with the character and setbacks of the street and providing the characteristic stepping up of built form towards the south and St. Mary's Church. This is demonstrated by the Visually Verified Montages provided as part of this Appeal. The Castle Street frontage follows the requirements set out in the Urban Framework Plan included in the Adopted Banbury Vision and Masterplan SPD and provides a high quality strategic landscape edge which provides much needed street trees and landscaping to create an attractive edge to the Town Centre. See Mr Jackson's Design Proof of Evidence for further details on architectural details, wall and surface materials.

7.16 Point 4.32 of the SoC states that:

"In addition to Policy ESD15 of the CLP 2015, The Banbury Vision and masterplan SPD also contains development principles and aspirations for the re-development of the site which must be considered. As previously discussed in the pre-application guidance, whilst the Banbury Vision and Masterplan envisages that 3 to 4-storey development might be acceptable on the site, regard must also be given to the surrounding older Victorian and Georgian development to Castle Street, which is a mix of 2 and 3-storey dwellings and North Bar. Whilst North Bar comprises 3-storey, buildings they are generally smaller in scale to that now proposed, and this is exacerbated by the land levels on the site relative to the adjacent Grade II Listed Building Trelawn House. It is considered that the overall scale and bulk of the building could be improved by proposing a mix of 2, 2.5, 3 and 4-storey building heights rising from west to east

across the site rather than the substantial 3 and 4-storey block proposed. The overall visual impact of the development could be further reduced by reducing the ground levels on site to those that would have originally related to the site. The scale of the proposed 4-storey building on this corner with its high eaves and hipped roof arrangement in relation to the existing Castle Street properties is demonstrated by the section shown on drawing number 10116BB-PA10. As discussed above, it is considered that the scheme would benefit from a lower building here."

7.17 The 3 and 4 storey Castle Street frontage is in line with the Adopted Banbury Vision and Masterplan SPD. The corner between Castle Street and Bolton Road is identified as requiring an "increase in building height" which the proposal reflects. Castle Street marks the transition between the Town Centre to the south and the predominantly residential area to the north, and warrants a difference in height between its southern and northern frontages to reflect the difference between these two areas. This building height is also softened by the high quality strategic landscape edge and street trees along Castle Street.

7.18 Point 4.33 of the SoC states that:

"In terms of the views of the building down North Bar, the blank gable ends at ground floor level are unfortunate. Further consideration must be given to providing fenestration here and therefore natural surveillance to North Bar and the adjacent footpath link which currently runs down the side of buildings along North Bar to Bolton Road. This is one of the key pedestrian links which must be improved as part of the Banbury 8 re-development proposals in order to increase connectivity to and integration with the Town Centre for the general public. It is not clear from the submission how this aspiration is achieved to create a safe and inviting pedestrian link between the buildings and adjacent car park separated by retaining wall and railings from North Bar through to Bolton Road and the Town Centre."

7.19 As Mr Jackson explains in his proof, the change in levels means that standard ground floor windows can't be used here as half the window would be underground. Therefore, whilst the ground floor gable ends in the south elevation to North Bar Street are blank, the first floor windows will provide passive surveillance of the footpath through to Bolton Road. This architectural solution will also ensure adequate privacy to future residents (see Mr Jackson's Proof of Evidence point 5.7.13 for further details). It should be noted that the Adopted Banbury Vision and Masterplan SPD for Banbury 8 does not include any specific requirements for this footpath connection. The existing footpath is narrow, flanked by blank walls with no overlooking and feels unsafe and unattractive (see site photo on p.23 of the Banbury Brochure submitted as part of this appeal), whilst the proposal opens up this link, enhances it significantly and provides natural surveillance to it.

Suggested Refusal Reason No.3

7.20 Point 4.44 of the SoC states that:

"This site can potentially act as an important catalyst for the remainder of Policy Banbury 8 being brought forward for development accordingly, although it should be noted that Policy Banbury 8 recommends that the whole site is developed as one rather than piecemeal as is the case here and the inclusion of the Tyre Depot within any redevelopment scheme was therefore encouraged through pre-application discussions. Failure to at least include the Tyre Depot within the application site, which is immediately alongside where occupants of the proposed development would gain vehicular access and where their external amenity space would be adjacent to and overlook, would fail to provide a coherent and integrated development."

7.21 Point 6.32 to 6.36 of this Proof of Evidence respond in detail to the Suggested Refusal Reason No.3 above and demonstrate that a coherent and integrated development is indeed achievable through a phased delivery of the Bingo and Tyre Depot sites in full compliance with Policy Banbury 8.

8.0 CONCLUSION

- 8.1 In relation to urban design matters, this evidence has demonstrated that the proposals will provide a high quality, appropriate and distinctive development in keeping with the Conservation Area, reflecting local character and well-integrated into its surroundings. It is my professional opinion that the proposals will provide distinctive placemaking wholly consistent with Policy ESD15 and Banbury 8 of the Cherwell Local Plan 2011-2031 Part 1, Policies C28 and C30 of Cherwell Local Plan 1996 Saved Policies, paragraphs 124, 126, 130, 131, 132 and 134 of the NPPF, the National Design Guide, and Building for a Healthy Life.
- 8.2 The proposals make best use of this brownfield site, providing homes for older people close to services and facilities, encouraging active travel and public transport, and providing shared facilities to foster social interaction and well-being.
- 8.3 My evidence has demonstrated in respect of Reasons for Refusal 1 and 3 that the proposal is in keeping with the character of the Conservation Area and pattern of development, and that the proposed scale and massing enhances the setting of the Grade II listed building Trelawn House and provide an appropriate urban design response to the important strategic transport node adjacent to the site. It also provides a high quality, coherent and integrated first phase of development to the Banbury 8 Area that future phases can build upon effectively to deliver the vision set out in Policy Banbury 8.
- 8.4 The arrangement of built form provides for distinctive building frontages, reflecting elements of the character of local buildings in a well-considered manner which will provide an appropriate sense of enclosure and streetscape to Castle Street and North Bar Street, as well as natural surveillance to the footpath connecting North Bar Street and Bolton Road.
- 8.5 I therefore commend the scheme to the Inspector in urban design terms.