

**Case Officer:** Emma Whitley                      **Recommendation:** Approve

**Applicant:** Mr & Mrs J Eeley

**Proposal:** Single storey extension to rear. Removal of existing conservatory and lean-to (resubmission of 20/02033/LB)

**Expiry Date:** 8 January 2021                      **Extension of Time:** Yes

---

## 1. APPLICATION SITE AND SUMMARY OF SIGNIFICANCE

- 1.1. Wendlebury Lodge (aka Wendlebury Manor) is a Grade II listed semi-detached dwelling, situated within the built-up village of Wendlebury. The building was formerly one dwelling with the attached Wendlebury House and the buildings date from the mid-18<sup>th</sup> Century. The building is constructed from limestone ashlar in both squared coursed rubble and random rubble. To the rear of the more formal front-range there are some later additions – with both a single-storey element and a flat-roofed castellated two-storey element.
- 1.2. The dwelling is not situated within a designated conservation area. The dwelling is situated within the Archaeological Alert Area of the Wendlebury historic core and swift nests have been identified within buildings on the site.

## 2. DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

- 2.1. This application relates to the erection of a single storey rear extension, with the removal of the existing conservatory and lean-to.
- 2.2. The proposed rear extension would protrude to the rear by approximately 5.7 metres and would be 10.6 metres wide. The maximum roof height would be 3 metres, dropping to an eaves height of 2.6 metres. Two roof lanterns are proposed, which would protrude by a maximum height of 0.7 metres above the roof height. One window and four patio doors are proposed to the rear (north elevation).

## 3. RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

- 3.1. The following planning history is considered relevant to the current proposal:

20/03035/LB – Single storey extension to rear, removal of existing conservatory and lean-to. *Application Refused.*

20/03034/F – Single storey extension to rear, removal of existing conservatory and lean-to. *Application Refused.*

18/00993/F – Demolish existing conservatory and replace with new Garden room. Demolish existing detached garage. *Application Permitted.*

18/00994/LB – Demolish existing conservatory and replace with new Garden room. Demolish existing detached garage. *Application Permitted.*

18/00320/DISC – Discharge of Conditions 3 (walls and roof materials) and 5 (doors, door linings, architraves, beading, skirtings' and staircases) of 18/00994/LB. *Application Permitted.*

18/00338/DISC – Discharge of conditions 3 (walls and roof finishes) and 5 (external joinery details) of 18/00993/F. *Application Permitted.*

18/01582/LB – New boiler and flue location; new roof tile vent to kitchen mechanical ventilation. *Application Permitted.*

18/01972/LB – Sub-division of existing second floor bedroom to provide two smaller children's rooms. *Application Permitted.*

- 3.2. The 2020 applications were refused as the proposals were considered to result in 'less than substantial' harm, of which couldn't be outweighed by public benefit as the benefit was only of a private nature to the applicants.

#### **4. PRE-APPLICATION DISCUSSIONS**

- 4.1. The following pre-application discussions have taken place with regard to this proposal:

18/00038/PREAPP – Potential replacement of existing rear conservatory with garden room and internal alterations to include new en-suite/dressing room and rationalisation of existing bedroom layouts.

- 4.2. Overall, it is considered that the works discussed would present an opportunity to sensitively restore the building to a status commensurate with the significance of the building. It is considered that a full historical survey of the building would be the most robust starting point for any works and that a certain flexibility on the part of the applicant to be guided by the results of this survey; in order to form a holistic proposal which combines the applicant's needs with those of the listed building. Historic England has produced a useful guide entitled 'Understanding Historic Buildings'.

#### **5. RESPONSE TO PUBLICITY**

- 5.1. This application has been publicised by way of a site notice displayed near the site and by advertisement in the local newspaper. The final date for comments was **26 December 2020**, although comments received after this date and before finalising this report have also been taken into account.

- 5.2. No comments have been raised by third parties.

#### **6. RESPONSE TO CONSULTATION**

- 6.1. Below is a summary of the consultation responses received at the time of writing this report. Responses are available to view in full on the Council's website, via the online Planning Register.

##### PARISH/TOWN COUNCIL AND NEIGHBOURHOOD FORUMS

- 6.2. Wendlebury Parish Council – **No objections or comments.**

##### OTHER CONSULTEES

- 6.3. Building Control (CDC) – **No objections. Comments:**

*Development would require a building regulations application.*

#### 6.4. Conservation (CDC) – **No objections. Comments:**

##### **Understanding the heritage assets affected**

*The property is half of the former manor house which is now 2 houses. The building can be dated to the Mid-18<sup>th</sup> century, possibly with an earlier core. Wendlebury Lodge is the range to the right, this part of the building is constructed of squared rubble limestone and has an earlier front to that on the neighbouring Wendlebury House. This elevation has a dentiled cornice and storeyband. There is a large window at ground floor which is an early 20<sup>th</sup> century alteration. The building has a continuous steep pitched roof with hipped roof dormers. To the rear the wall is obscured by additions however some large lunette windows remain. The property is a grade II Listed Building.*

##### **Significance**

*The significance of the building lies in its special interest as part of the manor house which can be dated back to the 18<sup>th</sup> century. There are some interesting features, most notably the lunette windows. Most of the significance comes with the external appearance and fabric as internally this section of the building has been significantly altered in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Therefore any historic fabric that remains should be preserved.*

##### **Proposals**

*Single storey extension to rear. Removal of existing conservatory and lean-to (resubmission of 20/02033/LB)*

##### **Appraisal of issues**

*The existing conservatory to be demolished is a late 20<sup>th</sup> century addition which does not contribute to the special character of the building, furthermore its removal will not result in a loss of historic fabric and therefore the principle of a replacement extension in this position is acceptable and has already been granted consent through a previous application.*

*The current proposal is larger than was approved previously and concerns were expressed about this in response to the most recent application. However the current proposal addresses a number of these concerns and the footprint and the massing of the extension has now been reduced. The design also leans towards a more ‘modular’ appearance as was the case with the design of the extension that was previously approved. The introduction of two roof lanterns is a more contemporary approach but this is considered to complement the appearance of the historic building. Overall on balance the proposed extension is not considered to be detrimental to the character of the Listed Building or result in an unacceptable loss of fabric.*

##### **Level of harm**

*The proposal is not considered to result in harm to the significance of the Listed Building.*

##### **Recommendation**

*There are no objections to the proposals*

##### **Conditions**

- *Details of materials*
- *External Joinery details*

## 7. RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY AND GUIDANCE

- 7.1. Planning law requires that applications for planning permission must be determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.
- 7.2. The Cherwell Local Plan 2011-2031 - Part 1 was formally adopted by Cherwell District Council on 20th July 2015 and provides the strategic planning policy framework for the District to 2031. The Local Plan 2011-2031 – Part 1 replaced a number of the ‘saved’ policies of the adopted Cherwell Local Plan 1996 though many of its policies are retained and remain part of the development plan. The relevant planning policies of Cherwell District’s statutory Development Plan are set out below:

CHERWELL LOCAL PLAN 2011 - 2031 PART 1 (CLP 2031 Part 1)

- ESD15 - The Character of the Built and Historic Environment

CHERWELL LOCAL PLAN 1996 SAVED POLICIES (CLP 1996)

- C18 – Development proposals affecting a listed building

7.3. Other Material Planning Considerations

- National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)
- Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)
- Managing Significance in Decision-Taking in the Historic Environment: Historic England Good Practice (2015)
- The Setting of Heritage Assets: Historic England Good Practice (2015)
- Cherwell Residential Design Guide (2018)
- Cherwell Council Home Extensions and Alterations Design Guide (2007)

## 8. APPRAISAL

- 8.1. The key issue for consideration in this case is the impact on the historic significance and setting of the listed building(s).
- 8.2. Section 16(2) of The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended) states that: *In considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority or the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.* Further, under Section 72(1) of the same Act the Local Planning Authority has a statutory duty to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of a Conservation Area.
- 8.3. Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas are designated heritage assets, and Paragraph 190 of the NPPF states that: *Local planning authorities should identify and assess the particular significance of any heritage asset that may be affected by a proposal (including by development affecting the setting of a heritage asset) taking account of the available evidence and any necessary expertise.*
- 8.4. Paragraph 193 of the NPPF directs that: *when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset’s conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance.* Policy ESD15 of the CLP 2031 Part 1 echoes this guidance.

- 8.5. The existing conservatory that would be demolished is not considered to contribute to the special character of the building and its removal would not result in a loss of historic fabric. Further, the principle of its removal has already been approved (application references 18/00993/F and 18/00994/LB). A smaller proposal for a rear extension to form a garden room was also approved under these applications.
- 8.6. The most recent proposals are larger than previously approved. However, this application addresses the concerns with regards to the previously refused rear extension, namely the footprint and massing of the extension. Further, the proposed design is considered to be of a more 'modular' appearance, which was considered acceptable in the 2018 applications.
- 8.7. The inclusion of two roof lanterns is considered to complement the appearance of the historic building.
- 8.8. Overall, on balance, the proposed extension is not considered to result in detrimental harm to the character and appearance of the listed building or result in an unacceptable loss of fabric.

## **9. RECOMMENDATION**

That consent is granted, subject to the following conditions:

1. The works to which this consent relates shall be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this consent.

Reason - To comply with the provisions of Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. Except where otherwise stipulated by conditions attached to this permission, the development shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the information contained within the application form and the following approved plans: drawing numbers 1007-7E, 1007-10B and 1007-11C.

Reason – For the avoidance of doubt, to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority and comply with Government guidance contained within the National Planning Policy Framework.

3. Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, a schedule of materials and finishes for the external walls and roof(s) of the development hereby approved shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter the development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved schedule.

Reason - To ensure that the completed development is in keeping with and conserves the special character of the existing historic building and to comply with Policy ESD 15 of the Cherwell Local Plan 2011-2031, saved Policy C18 of the Cherwell Local Plan 1996 and Government guidance contained within the National Planning Policy Framework.

4. The natural stone to be used on the walls of the extension shall be of the same type, texture, colour and appearance as the stone on the existing building and shall be laid dressed, coursed and pointed to match that of the existing building.

Reason - To ensure that the completed development is in keeping with and conserves the special character of the existing historic building and to comply with Policy ESD 15 of the Cherwell Local Plan 2011-2031, saved Policy C18 of the Cherwell Local Plan 1996 and Government guidance contained within the National Planning Policy Framework.

5. Prior to the commencement of the development, full details of the doors, door linings, architraves, beading and skirtings' hereby approved, at a scale of 1:20 including a cross section, recess detail and colour/finish, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter the doors and windows shall be installed within the building in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - To ensure that the completed development is in keeping with and conserves the special character of the existing historic building and to comply with Policy ESD 15 of the Cherwell Local Plan 2011-2031, saved Policy C18 of the Cherwell Local Plan 1996 and Government guidance contained within the National Planning Policy Framework.

Case Officer: Emma Whitley

DATE: 8 January 2021

Checked By: Paul Ihringer

DATE: 8/1/21